

1 **Minutes**

2 **South Carolina Real Estate Appraisers Board**

3 **Thursday, August 11, 2022 at 10:00 a.m.**

4 Synergy Business Park, Kingstree Building, Conference Room 108

5 110 Centerview Drive, Columbia, South Carolina 29210

6

7 **Meeting Called to Order:**

8 Jake Knight, Chairman, called the meeting of the South Carolina Real Estate Appraisers Board to
9 order at 10:00 a.m. Other members present for the meeting included: Chris Donato, Mike Dodds,
10 Chris Barczak and Mark Chapman.

11 Mr. Knight announced that public notice of this meeting was properly posted at the South
12 Carolina Real Estate Appraisers office, Synergy Business Park, Kingstree Building, and provided
13 to all requesting persons, organizations, and news media in compliance with Section 30-4-80 of
14 the South Carolina Freedom of Information Act.

15 Staff members participating during the meeting included Wick Stuart, Office of Advice Counsel;
16 Laura Smith, Administrator; Erin Baldwin, Office of Disciplinary Counsel; and Malcolm Burton,
17 Office of Investigations.

18 The following members of the public were present: Robert Thomas. Robert Giorgio, Marilyn
19 Woods and James Woods attended virtually through WebEx.

20

21 **Introduction of Board Members and All Other Persons Attending**

22 All board members, staff and public attendees introduced themselves.

23

24 **Approval of Excused Absences**

25 **MOTION:**

26 Mr. Donato made the motion to excuse Rex Casterline for the reason given to the Administrator.
27 Mr. Dodds seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

28

29 **Approval of Agenda**

30 **MOTION:**

31 Mr. Dodds made the motion to approve the agenda. Mr. Donato seconded the motion, which
32 carried unanimously.

33

34 **Approval of the Minutes from the May 5, 2022 Board Meeting**

35 **MOTION:**

36 Mr. Chapman made the motion to approve the minutes from the May 5, 2022 board meeting.
37 Mr. Dodds seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

38

39 **Chairman's Remarks**

40 Mr. Knight stated his appreciation for those in attendance with this being the first in-person
41 meeting since COVID started.

42

43 **Approval of the Investigative Review Committee (IRC) Report- Malcolm Burton**

44 The IRC report dated July 26, 2022 presented for approval. Discussion ensued.

45

46 **DISMISSALS**

Case #	Investigator	Initial Complaint Allegations	IRC Logic
2021-45	Mac Burton	Comparable sales used not same quality, 2 nd appraisal 60K higher.	Dismissal – No evidence
2021-50	Mac Burton	Respondent, who is a licensed BIC, advertised that he is a licensed South Carolina Appraiser.	Dismissal – No evidence
2021-54	Mac Burton	Respondent is a real estate agent who completed a CMA and called the selling price “Fair Market Value.”	Dismissal – No evidence
2021-61	Mac Burton	Tax dispute in which improper comps used by the county’s appraiser.	Dismissal – No evidence
2021-66	Mac Burton	Fannie Mae’s appraiser tracking system for appraisal submissions indicates that Respondent has submitted numerous appraisals for	Dismissal – No evidence

		the same effective date with each being separated by distances that would not physically be possible to visit in the same day.	
2021-71	Mac Burton	Value Dispute. Homeowner provided three additional sales for consideration to lender, one of which was already in the report. Disagrees with all sales used, the lack of time adjustments, condition of subject, and other property descriptions.	Dismissal – No evidence

47

48 **FORMAL COMPLAINTS**

Case #	Investigator	Initial Complaint Allegations	IRC Logic
2021-64	Mac Burton	Report uses comparable sales that are more distant and have an older date of sale than similar sales within the subject's subdivision and have a more recent date of sale.	Formal Complaint

49

50 **LETTERS OF CAUTION**

Case #	Investigator	Initial Complaint Allegations	IRC Logic
2021-42	Mac Burton	Comparable sales used not same quality, 2 nd appraisal 60K higher.	Letter of Caution
2021-43	Mac Burton	Value dispute, exterior renovations not fully adjusted. Value \$30,000 less than contract price.	Letter of Caution
2021-51	Mac Burton	The report contains errors and the loan was not approved based on report stating the heating source is not permanent. Appraiser did not look in attic nor crawl space, other errors in property description.	Letter of Caution
2021-60	Mac Burton	Physical description errors, GLA less than prior report, value dispute.	Letter of Caution
2021-62	Mac Burton	Comps included older MHG's, subject is new, no adjustments for age. Value dispute	Letter of Caution

2021-68	Mac Burton	Value dispute, comp selection over 1 year, distance, sales not similar, GLA incorrect, reconciliation not summarized, neighborhood boundaries incorrect.	Letter of Caution
2021-74	Mac Burton	Several incorrect physical descriptions of the property.	Letter of Caution

51

52 **MOTION:**

53 Mr. Dodds made the motion to accept the IRC recommendations for formal complaints, letters of
 54 caution and dismissals. Mr. Donato seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

55

56

57 **OIE Appraisers Board Case Report – Malcolm Burton**

58 **OIE Status Report as of August 11, 2022**

Total Complaints Received 1/1/2022-7/29/2022	41
Active Investigations (Average Age 100 days)	17
Closed	3

59

60 **Office of Disciplinary Counsel (ODC) Update – Erin Baldwin**

61 **ODC Case Load Statistics as of July 27, 2022**

Board	Open Cases	Pending Hearings & Agreements	Pending Closure	Closed	Appeals
Appraisers	4	2	0	0	0
			*Closed since last report:	0	
			*Closed since 1/1/22	4	

62

63

64 **Application Hearings**

65 Testimony given in regard to reinstate license for Mr. Robert Giorgio.

66 **MOTION:**

67 Mr. Donato made the motion to approve Mr. Giorgio for reinstatement of his Certified
68 Residential Appraiser license. Mr. Dodds seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

69

70 Testimony given in regard to reinstate license for Mr. Robert Thomas.

71 **MOTION:**

72 Mr. Barczak made the motion to go into executive session for legal advice. Mr. Chapman
73 seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

74 **MOTION:**

75 Mr. Dodds made the motion to return from executive session. Mr. Donato seconded the motion,
76 which carried unanimously.

77 **MOTION:**

78 Mr. Barczak made the motion to deny Mr. Thomas's application for reinstatement. Mr. Dodds
79 seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

80

81 **Compliance Hearing**

82 **MOTION:**

83 Mr. Donato made the motion to remove Mr. Davis's compliance hearing from the agenda due to
84 Mr. Davis not being present. Mr. Dodds seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

85

86 **Disciplinary Hearing**

87 **MOTION:**

88 Mr. Donato made the motion to continue Mr. Davison's disciplinary hearing to the next board
89 meeting on November 30, 2022. Mr. Dodds seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

90

91 **Administrators Remarks - Laura Smith**

92 **Licensure Update**

93 **SC REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD NUMBER OF CREDENTIALS**

94 **AS OF August 10, 2022**

	ACTIVE	INACTIVE	ACTIVE IN RENEWAL	TOTAL
Apprentice	234	0	60	234
Licensed	136	12	20	148
Certified Residential	988	48	93	1036
Certified General	983	32	106	1015
Licensed Mass	47	0	7	47
Certified Residential Mass	71	3	9	74
Certified General Mass	24	2	6	26
Total	2483	97	301	2881

95

96 **AMC Active 143 AMC Inactive 24 AMC Lapsed 14**

97 **TEMPORARY PERMITS**

ISSUED IN 2021	ISSUED IN 2022
202	122

98

99

100 Mrs. Smith updated the board on renewal numbers from the June 30, 2022 appraiser renewals
101 and indicated staff was currently completing the continuing education audit. The CE audit is
102 being conducted on all appraisers with information from CE Broker, which is tracking
103 continuing education for all appraisers. Discussion ensued.

104

105 **Budget Update**

106 Mrs. Smith provided the budget report for the Appraisers Board Account (\$1,354,165.00) for
107 review by the Board. The National Registry Account (\$136,427.08), was also presented to the
108 Board for review. This account is allocated to pay the National Registry fees to the Appraisal
109 Subcommittee. These numbers are ending balances as of June 30, 2022.

110

111

112 **Appraiser Conferences**

113 Mrs. Smith asked the board members to check their calendars for the dates October 14-17, 2022,
114 for the AARO Conference. As well as in-state conferences, SCPAC Conference to be held in
115 Greenville, October 7, 2022 and the Assessor's Conference to be held in Beaufort, October 28,
116 2022. Mrs. Smith further updated the board that the Spring AARO Conference will be held in
117 Savannah, Georgia, May 8-11, 2023.

118

119 **MOTION:**

120 Mr. Donato made a motion for the board to approve the administrator and two board members to
121 attend the AARO conference. Mr. Dodds seconded the motion.

122

123 **New Business**

124 **Regulatory Review**

125 Mr. Donato made the motion for the board that no changes needed on the appraiser regulations at
126 this time and grant authority to the Board Chairman to submit the report on behalf of the board.
127 Mr. Dodds seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

128

129 **Statute Update**

130 Mrs. Smith stated that the current bill for the appraiser's statute died in legislation due to the SC
131 Senate not voting on the bill. A new bill will need to be submitted in January when the new
132 session begins. Mrs. Smith recommended to the board, just as in year's past, the board could
133 create a task force to review the statutes and recommend any changes that the board could vote
134 on at their next meeting.

135

136 **MOTION:**

137 Mr. Donato made a motion for the board to create the task force made up of interested
138 associations. The task force would include two board members, Mark Chapman and Chris
139 Donato, along with representatives from Appraisal Institute, SCPAC, Realtors, REVVA,
140 Banker's Association and the Association of Assessing Officers. Mr. Barczak second the
141 motion, which carried unanimously.

142

143 **Public Comments**

144 None

145

146 **Adjournment**

147 Mr. Donato made the motion to adjourn. Mr. Dodds seconded, which carried unanimously.

148

149

150 The next Real Estate Appraisers board meeting is scheduled for November 30, 2022.