

## **Minutes**

### **South Carolina Real Estate Appraisers Board**

**Friday, February 17, 2017 at 10:00 a.m.**

Synergy Business Park, Kingstree Building, Conference Room 105

110 Centerview Drive, Columbia, South Carolina 29210

#### **Meeting Called to Order:**

Jake Knight, Chairman, called the meeting of the South Carolina Real Estate Appraisers Board to order at 10:02 a.m. Other members present for the meeting included: Chris Barczak, Rex Casterline, Michael Dodds, Christopher Donato, and Ann King

Mr. Knight announced that public notice of this meeting was properly posted at the S.C. Real Estate Appraisers office, Synergy Business Park, Kingstree Building, and provided to all requesting persons, organizations, and news media in compliance with Section 30-4-80 of the South Carolina Freedom of Information Act.

Staff members participating during the meeting included: Mary League, Advice Counsel; Erin Baldwin, Office of Disciplinary Counsel; Sharon Wolfe, Office of Investigations, Malcolm Burton, Office of Investigations; Joi Middleton, Real Estate Commission (Education Coordinator), Laura Smith, Administrator; Ty'Yona Schofield, Administrative Assistant.

Two public members (Willie King and Jeff Thordale) were present, and two Appraisal Subcommittee Policy Managers (Jenny Tidwell and Neal Fenochietti).

**Pledge of Allegiance** was recited by all present.

#### **Introduction of Board Members and All Other Persons Attending**

All board members, staff and public attendees introduced themselves.

### **Approval of Excused Absences**

#### **MOTION:**

Mr. Casterline made the motion to excuse the absence of Andrew Johnson for the reasons given to the Administrator. Mr. Dodds seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

### **Approval of Agenda:**

#### **MOTION:**

Mr. Casterline made the motion to approve the Agenda as published. Mr. Donato seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

### **Approval of the Minutes from January 11, 2017 Meeting**

#### **MOTION:**

Mr. Casterline made the motion to approve the minutes as written. Mr. Donato seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

### **Chairman's Remarks**

Mr. Knight kept his remarks at a minimum. He wanted to welcome the Appraisal Subcommittee and look forward to hearing the Report as the big item on the Agenda.

**Administrators Remarks - Laura Smith**

**Budget Update**

Ms. Smith provided the Budget Report for the Appraisers Board Account and the National Registry Account. She stated the Reports Balances are staying consistent. A brief discussion ensued.

**Licensure Update**

**SC REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD NUMBER OF CREDENTIALS AS OF  
FEBRUARY 8, 2017**

	<b>ACTIVE</b>	<b>INACTIVE</b>	<b>ACTIVE IN RENEWAL</b>	<b>TOTAL</b>
<b>Apprentice</b>	158	0	37	195
<b>Licensed</b>	138	30	22	190
<b>Certified Residential</b>	956	53	93	1102
<b>Certified General</b>	931	31	147	1109
<b>Licensed Mass</b>	48	1	10	59
<b>Certified Residential Mass</b>	64	3	8	75
<b>Certified General Mass</b>	28	2	1	31
<b>Total</b>	<b>2323</b>	<b>120</b>	<b>318</b>	<b>2761</b>

**TEMPORARY PERMITS**

<b>ISSUED IN 2016</b>	<b>ISSUED IN 2017</b>
239	22

## **AARO Conference**

The AARO 2017 Spring Conference will be held April 7, 2017- April 10, 2017. Ms. Smith stated the State will pay upfront for the registration. Ms. Smith also stated the Conference Registration deadline is March 10, 2017.

### **MOTION:**

Mr. Donato made the motion to approve two Board Members and Administrator Laura Smith to attend the AARO 2017 Spring Conference. Mr. Dodds seconded the motion. The votes carried unanimously.

\*\*\*Ms. Smith also reminded the Board that March 30, 2017 will be the last date to file with the State's Ethic Commission. Anything received after the last date will be assessed a late fee.

### **Appraisal Subcommittee Report- Jenny Tidwell & Neal Fenochietti**

The purpose of the periodic Compliance Review is to monitor the requirements established by the States for certification and licensing of Appraisers qualified to perform appraisals in connection with federally related transactions.

#### **2017 Compliance Review Summary:**

**State:** South Carolina

**ASC Finding:** Excellent

**Review Cycle:** Two-Year (May 2015- February 2017)

Ms. Tidwell stated this Excellent rating means the State meets all Title XI mandates and complies with requirements of ASC Policy Statements, the State maintains a strong Regulatory Program, and the State is a very low risk of Program failure. Ms. Tidwell stated this finding will be Public Record and published in Annual Report for 2017 and on the website. Discussion ensued.

**New Business**

**Approval of the Investigative Review Committee (IRC) Report- Sharon Wolfe**

The IRC report dated February 3, 2017 presented for approval. Discussion ensued.

**DISMISS**

<b>Case #</b>	<b>Investigator</b>	<b>Initial Complaint Allegations</b>	<b>IRC Logic</b>
2016-19	Malcolm Burton	The complainant thinks the appraisal failed to consider the additional lot associated with an appraisal he did for a property in Duncan, SC, which she was trying to sell for \$110,000.	No evidence of violation. Complainant did not cooperate and did not provide appraisal as requested. Complaint withdrawn.
2016-21	Malcolm Burton	Misconduct	Insufficient evidence. Appraiser used appropriate techniques and defended his measurements and comp selection. Investigator performed standard 3 review of appraisal.
2016-22	Malcolm Burton	Value Dispute	Insufficient evidence. Appraiser used appropriate techniques and defended his measurements and comp selection. Investigator performed standard 3 review of appraisal.
2016-23	Malcolm Burton	The complaint is a value dispute. However, the complainant did submit sales to the lender to forward to the appraiser for consideration. The report provided by the complainant does not contain a response about those sales.	Insufficient evidence. Respondent gave sufficient comps. All additional issues by complainant were addressed appropriately by respondent in final report. Investigator performed standard 3 review of appraisal.

**LETTER OF CAUTION**

<b>Case #</b>	<b>Investigator</b>	<b>Initial Complaint Allegations</b>	<b>IRC Logic</b>
2016-10	Malcolm Burton	Uniform Standards violations	Be mindful of scope of work which includes client requirements. Investigator performed standard 3 review of appraisal.

**MOTION:**

Mr. Donato made a motion to approve the IRC report. Mr. Dodds seconded the motion. The votes carried unanimously

**OIE APPRAISER'S BOARD CASE REPORT**

**Cases received from January 1, 2017 – February 8, 2017**

<b>Case Statuses</b>	<b>Total</b>
<b>Active Investigation</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>Do Not Open Case</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>8</b>

**39 TOTAL ACTIVE CASES**

**Cases closed January 1, 2017 – February 8, 2017**

<b>Case Statuses</b>	<b>Total</b>
<b>Closed</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Do Not Open Case</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>6</b>

**Office of Disciplinary Counsel (ODC) Update - Erin Baldwin**

**OGC Case Load Statistics as of February 16, 2017**

<b>Board</b>	<b>Open Cases</b>	<b>Pending actions</b>	<b>Pending CA/MOAs</b>	<b>Pending Hearings</b>	<b>Pending Board Action</b>	<b>Pending Final Orders</b>	<b>Closed</b>
<b>Appraisers</b>		0	0	1	0		3

**\*\*\*\*Closed Cases 1/1/16 thru 12/31/16 13**

**\*\*\*\*Closed Cases on or after 12/22/16 3**

Ms. Baldwin gave an update on the cases currently on her desk. Presuming there aren't any issues and this is acceptable by the Board, Ms. Baldwin proposed having a two day meeting scheduled for May 4, 2017 and May 5, 2017 on a rolling docket. Discussion ensued.

**Unfinished Business**

**Appraisal Management Company (AMC) Bill**

Mr. Knight stated the final Bill that came out of the Subcommittee has been filed. Ms. Smith provided a copy of the Bill and the Amendments to the Board.

**Executive Session**

None.

**Public Comments**

None.

**Adjournment**

Mr. Donato made the motion to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Casterline seconded the motion which carried unanimously. The next Real Estate Appraisers board meeting is scheduled for May 4, 2017.